

[REDACTED]

---

**From:** Fitzroy, Mark  
**Sent:** Thursday, 19 May 2016 10:15 AM  
**To:** Webb, Trevor; Duffy, Gillian; Fletcher, Nick; Butow, Barbara; Crossley, Steve; Crerar, Scott  
**Cc:** Lewis, Janine  
**Subject:** RE: FoE on nano in baby formula [SEC=UNOFFICIAL]

Hi Trevor,

No, I checked these as well and I don't believe they are the same. The three we have listed and permitted are not the same as the compound they refer to.

Mark

---

**From:** Webb, Trevor  
**Sent:** Thursday, 19 May 2016 10:13 AM  
**To:** Duffy, Gillian; Fletcher, Nick; Butow, Barbara; Fitzroy, Mark; Crossley, Steve; Crerar, Scott  
**Cc:** Lewis, Janine  
**Subject:** RE: FoE on nano in baby formula [SEC=UNOFFICIAL]

Thanks Gill,

But you pls double check that. The EU SCCS report lists **calcium phosphatetribasic** as another chemical name for **hydroxyapatite** and that appears to be a form listed in S17-3

[http://ec.europa.eu/health/scientific\\_committees/consumer\\_safety/docs/sccs\\_o\\_191.pdf](http://ec.europa.eu/health/scientific_committees/consumer_safety/docs/sccs_o_191.pdf)

*Dr Trevor Webb  
A/g General Manager*

*Food, Information Science & Technology Branch  
Food Standards Australia New Zealand*

[REDACTED]

---

**From:** Duffy, Gillian  
**Sent:** Thursday, 19 May 2016 9:47 AM  
**To:** Fletcher, Nick; Webb, Trevor; Butow, Barbara; Fitzroy, Mark; Crossley, Steve; Crerar, Scott  
**Cc:** Lewis, Janine  
**Subject:** RE: FoE on nano in baby formula [SEC=UNOFFICIAL]

Hi All

Just confirming that hydroxyapatite is not a permitted form of calcium in the Code and specifically not in infant formula. Also not listed as a food additive for use in infant formula products. Am still searching the US FDA but can only see it as an ingredient in dietary supplements thus far (would be regulated by TGA in Aust).

FYI these products are only available for purchase in the US however a couple of US based companies do ship to Australia – the two I came across are amazon.com (not Australian amazon site) and iherb.com

Gill

---

**From:** Fletcher, Nick  
**Sent:** Thursday, 19 May 2016 9:28 AM  
**To:** Duffy, Gillian; Webb, Trevor; Butow, Barbara; Fitzroy, Mark; Crossley, Steve; Crerar, Scott  
**Subject:** RE: FoE on nano in baby formula [SEC=UNOFFICIAL]

Hi Trevor,

I'll review the reports.

Gill and Mark to advise whether this is a permitted additive/form in infant formula.

Nick

---

**From:** Webb, Trevor  
**Sent:** Wednesday, 18 May 2016 10:16 PM  
**To:** McCutcheon, Steve; Haase, Lorraine  
**Cc:** Butow, Barbara; Fletcher, Nick; May, Peter; Crerar, Scott; Neal, Glen  
**Subject:** RE: FoE on nano in baby formula [SEC=UNOFFICIAL]

Thanks Lorraine/Steve,

Steve - We will look into it and provide advice as soon as practicable.

Nick/Barbara - Can you please review the referenced reports. The SCCS report is available at [http://ec.europa.eu/health/scientific\\_committees/consumer\\_safety/docs/sccs\\_o\\_191.pdf](http://ec.europa.eu/health/scientific_committees/consumer_safety/docs/sccs_o_191.pdf)  
Scott – talk to you in the morning

The FoE US Study commissioned by the university of Arizona is available at : [http://webiva-downton.s3.amazonaws.com/877/90/d/8141/ASU\\_FOE\\_Baby\\_Formula\\_Report\\_May\\_4\\_2016\\_FINAL.pdf](http://webiva-downton.s3.amazonaws.com/877/90/d/8141/ASU_FOE_Baby_Formula_Report_May_4_2016_FINAL.pdf)

The Conversation have also picked up on the story: <http://theconversation.com/nanoparticles-in-baby-formula-should-parents-be-worried-59246>  
FoE USA has further information: <http://www.foe.org/projects/food-and-technology/nanotechnology/baby-formula>

Trevor

*Dr Trevor Webb  
A/g General Manager  
Food, Information Science & Technology Branch  
Food Standards Australia New Zealand*

---

**From:** McCutcheon, Steve  
**Sent:** Wednesday, 18 May 2016 6:09 PM  
**To:** Haase, Lorraine  
**Cc:** Butow, Barbara; Webb, Trevor; Fletcher, Nick; May, Peter; Crerar, Scott; Neal, Glen  
**Subject:** Re: FoE on nano in baby formula [SEC=UNOFFICIAL]

Thanks Lorraine.  
Trevor/Scott - please assess the report referenced by FoE and provide me with advice.  
Steve

Sent from my iPhone

On 18 May 2016, at 5:18 PM, Haase, Lorraine [REDACTED] wrote:

P.s I have also forwarded to INC and Janine.

---

**From:** Haase, Lorraine  
**Sent:** Wednesday, 18 May 2016 5:16 PM  
**To:** Butow, Barbara; Webb, Trevor; Fletcher, Nick; McCutcheon, Steve; May, Peter; Crerar, Scott; Neal, Glen  
**Subject:** FoE on nano in baby formula [SEC=UNOFFICIAL]

All – for information and in case we need talking points at some stage

<http://www.foe.org.au/articles/2016-05-18/fsanz-fails-us-again-risky-nanoparticles-found-baby-formula>

**Lorraine Haase**

**Manager Communication and Stakeholder Engagement**

55 Blackall Street, Barton, ACT 2600

PO Box 7186, Canberra BC, ACT 2610

<image001.jpg>

*A safe food supply which supports the health  
of people in Australia and New Zealand*

<image002.gif> <image003.jpg>